

**Director:** Dave Pearson, Director of Transport Services  
**Author:** Alistair Ryder



---

**Report to:** Transport Committee  
**Date:** 12 January 2018  
**Subject:** Leeds Clean Air Zone Proposal

---

Is this a key decision?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Is the decision eligible for call-in?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Does the report contain confidential or exempt information?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
If relevant, state paragraph number of Schedule 12a, Local Government Act 1972, Part 1	

## 1 Purpose

- 1.1 To provide an overview of the proposed 'Class B' Clean Air Zone for Leeds.
- 1.2 To highlight issues to be worked through collaboratively with Leeds City Council including potential impacts for different transport sectors within West Yorkshire and the region.

## 2 Information

- 2.1 Clean air is important for the Leeds City Region. The West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) recognises the benefits that cleaner air has on improving public health and creating quality places for people who live and work here and to attract investment.
- 2.2 The majority of the region benefits from clean air, however there are pockets of mainly urban, populated areas with sufficiently poor air quality as to exceed statutory annual emission limits. The adopted West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy estimates that harmful emissions – especially from transport - are responsible for 1 in 20 premature deaths in West Yorkshire.
- 2.3 In July 2017 the Department for Environment, Farming and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) published the National Air Quality Plan which requires 28 local authorities that are forecast to exceed statutory Nitrogen Dioxide (NO<sub>2</sub>) emission limits by 2020, to produce action plans detailing how they will ensure NO<sub>2</sub> compliance within the shortest possible time. Within West Yorkshire, Leeds City Council is the only named local authority required to act.

- 2.4 The Plan details a number of mechanisms that local authorities could implement to reduce NO<sub>2</sub> emissions including chargeable and non-chargeable Clean Air Zones (CAZs), including analysis of their perceived effectiveness and implementation costs.
- 2.5 Leeds City Council has analysed several options for achieving NO<sub>2</sub> compliance by 2020. This includes analysis of different chargeable CAZ scenarios - considered the most effective mechanism to reduce emissions to within statutory limits in the shortest timeframe.
- 2.6 A CAZ aims to address all sources of pollution within a specified geographic boundary, including NO<sub>2</sub> and particulate matter, and reduce public exposure to these emissions using a range of measures tailored to the particular location.
- 2.7 CAZs do not ban or prevent any vehicle from entering the 'zone' however those vehicles that do not meet minimum engine standards would need to pay a daily charge for entering the 'zone'. The minimum engine standards that would be applicable are Euro 4 for petrol vehicles or Euro 6 for diesel vehicles.
- 2.8 Table 1 show the different vehicles included within each class of CAZ for which the minimum emission standards apply.

**Table 1 – Clean Air Zone Classes**

CAZ Class	Vehicles Included
A	Buses, coaches and taxis
B	Buses, coaches, taxis and Heavy Goods Vehicles (HGVs)
C	Buses, coaches, taxis, HGVs and Light Goods Vehicles (LGVs)
D	Buses, coaches, taxis, HGVs and Light Goods Vehicles (LGVs) and private cars (option to include motorbikes and mopeds).

#### **Possible Clean Air Zone Charging Rates**

- 2.9 Within different modelled CAZ scenarios Leeds City Council has used the charges that are to be applied in London's Ultra Low Emission Zone (ULEZ) as shown in Table 2. Further work is planned to determine an appropriate charging framework for any Leeds CAZ but the charge set will need to ensure that a sufficient level of replacement and retrofit is delivered.

**Table 2 – London ULEV Zone Charges Used for Leeds CAZ Scenarios**

Vehicle Class	Daily charge for non-compliant vehicles
Buses/Coaches	£100.00
HGVs	£100.00
Taxi and private hire	£12.50
LGVs	£12.50
Private car	£12.50

## Preferred CAZ Option

- 2.10 Leeds City Council has modelled and appraised several chargeable CAZ scenarios of different 'classes' and geographical boundaries against their perceived effectiveness to deliver NO<sub>2</sub> compliance and whether they have a significant negative economic impact for residents and businesses.
- 2.11 The scenarios included CAZs bounded by or inclusive of the Leeds Inner Ring Road, however these were considered to worsen air quality on roads just outside the CAZ - especially inner city residential areas- through significant 'rat-running' journeys to avoid payment.
- 2.12 A Class D CAZ bounded by the Leeds Outer Ring Road would impact on all vehicle types and is considered to achieve NO<sub>2</sub> compliance, but would also have a significant negative economic impact on a high proportion of Leeds' population, especially the poorest communities due to inadequate national grant support to covert non-compliant private and commercial vehicles.
- 2.13 Leeds City Council is advocating a Class B CAZ that is defined by, but does not include the Outer Ring Road, with the M1 and M62 providing the border to the South/East of the city. The proposed Class B CAZ will charge buses, coaches, HGVs, taxis and private hire vehicles operating within the CAZ that do not meet minimum emission standards. No charge would apply to vehicles that divert around the Outer Ring Road/motorways, or vehicles that cross the city using the M621 unless they left the M621 to enter the city.
- 2.14 The Class B CAZ has been selected as it will achieve the required emission reductions and improve health outcomes across the wider district whilst minimising economic impact. The council will work with the affected sectors to secure funding from central government to enable them to transition to a cleaner fleet.
- 2.15 On Thursday 13 December 2017 the Leeds City Council Executive Board approved public consultation on the proposal to introduce a Clean Air Zone B within the Outer Ring Road/motorway network with additional measures. Due to the marginal nature of its compliance in some areas, the council is proposing that additional measures are also introduced to ensure that the overall solution does reach compliance. As part of the consultation Leeds will be exploring how it can best achieve the shift of the taxi and private hire fleet to ULEV whether it be via charging any non ULEV or whether simply a robust package of incentives can be relied upon.
- 2.16 WYCA recognises the benefits of cleaner air, the adopted West Yorkshire Transport Strategy policies include support for 'the implementation of CAZs where needed' [policy 8] and support for 'delivering the recommendations of the adopted West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy' [policy 7].
- 2.17 Public consultation will run from 2<sup>nd</sup> January to 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2018. It is proposed that WYCA will build on its strong collaborative relationship with Leeds City Council to

support CAZ implementation and work through key issues identified for different transport sectors.

### **Potential Issues for West Yorkshire Transport Sectors**

- 2.18 Bus and Heavy Goods Vehicle emissions have improved significantly since the introduction of the Euro Emission Standards. This is due to advancements in technology and a rigorous emission test cycle which replicates real-world environments. This has ensured that Nitrogen Oxides tailpipe emissions from new Euro VI diesel buses have reduced by 75% compared with previous Euro V engines and particulate matter emissions have reduced by 66%<sup>1</sup>. There is also evidence to suggest that a Euro VI diesel car produces 10 times as many NOx emissions per litre of fuel as a Euro VI diesel bus<sup>2</sup>.
- 2.19 WYCA recognises the potential impact the proposed chargeable CAZ will have for large and small bus operators and other sectors important to our regional economy such as heavy goods vehicles and coaches.
- 2.20 Large bus operators First, Arriva and Transdev have already committed to operating fully Euro VI bus fleets in Leeds by 2020. They are likely to do this through a combination of new bus purchases, retrofitting vehicles with equipment to achieve a Euro VI standard, and moving older vehicles out of the CAZ to other areas. WYCA will monitor the movement of older vehicles to other West Yorkshire areas and seek government funding to mitigate the risk that other parts of West Yorkshire are adversely impacted by the CAZ through vehicle displacement.
- 2.21 SME bus and coach operators have little or no opportunity to move their fleets around and generally have few Euro VI vehicles, so they are likely to be more seriously affected by the proposed CAZ. They will be faced with either buying new buses, retrofitting older vehicles to Euro VI standard, or paying the daily charge to operate within the CAZ.
- 2.22 Where these operators run tendered local bus services, any additional costs for new or retrofitted vehicles on existing contracts are likely to be passed on to WYCA. The legislation could also lead to fewer small operators tendering for services in Leeds with a reduction in competition potentially leading to higher tender prices.
- 2.23 The following small operators either operate local bus services within the CAZ or have depots within the CAZ:
- Connexions (Harrogate Coach Travel) – services 8, 8A, 8B and 38 operate within the CAZ
  - CT Plus – depot within the CAZ; operating school services
  - Fourway Coaches – service 31 operates within the CAZ

---

<sup>1</sup> Low Carbon Vehicle Partnership ; ‘ The Low Emission Bus Guide’ 2016

<sup>2</sup> The International Council on Clean Transportation; ‘NOX emissions from heavy-duty and light-duty diesel vehicles in the EU: Comparison of real-world performance and current type-approval requirements’ 2017

- Squarepeg – depot within the CAZ; services 9, 22 and 80 operate within the CAZ
- Tetleys – depot within the CAZ; operating school services and Wakefield City Bus
- Yorkshire Tiger – services 757 and 781 operate within the CAZ

2.24 WYCA will work with all bus operators to support fleet transition towards the latest Euro VI standards and ensure CAZ compliance.

2.25 WYCA will work with Leeds City Council to support the taxi and private hire sectors and offer measures to accelerate Ultra-low Emission Vehicle (ULEV) uptake including delivery of the ULEV Taxi Scheme.

### **Activities to support air quality improvement in Leeds**

2.26 WYCA is supporting Leeds City Council and the other West Yorkshire local authorities to improve air quality and reduce vehicle emissions through the following interventions that deliver the West Yorkshire Transport Strategy and West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy;

- **2017 Clean Bus Technology Fund** – WYCA submitted an application in November 2017 for capital grant funding to support West Yorkshire commercial bus operators in ensuring their fleets comply with Clean Air Zone emission standards through retrofit emission control technology.
- **Low Emission Bus Scheme** - From December 2017 the Leeds' Elland Road and Temple Green Park and Ride sites will benefit from brand new low emission vehicles partly funded via the DfT's Low Emission Bus Scheme. The new buses are forecast to reduce Nitrogen Dioxide emissions by 1.54 tonnes per year, which is a 50% improvement on existing vehicles on the services.
- **2014-15 Clean Bus Technology Fund /Clean Vehicle Technology Fund** – WYCA successfully delivered retrofit emission improvement technology on 165 'Mybus' school buses and 32 Access Buses.
- **ULEV Taxi Scheme** – WYCA is delivering £1.98m in grant funding for a series of charge points dedicated to use by taxi and private hire vehicles with delivery phase to commence in 2018.
- **EcoStars** - Ongoing delivery of the Eco Stars fleet accreditation programme, targeting fleet environmental improvement through driver behaviour training and audits of fleet performance. West Yorkshire's three main bus operators; First Bus, TransDev and Arriva are committed to the delivery of EcoStars and improving the environmental performance of their vehicles.
- **CityConnect Cycling and Walking Programme** – CityConnect is building high quality cycling and walking infrastructure across West Yorkshire, including the 23km Leeds to Bradford Cycle Superhighway and upgraded canal towpaths, primarily on the Leeds to Liverpool canal. CityConnect also delivers cycle training, cycle challenges, business and school support and behaviour change campaigns, all with the aim of encouraging walking and cycling.

### **3 Financial Implications**

- 3.1 There is potential that a chargeable CAZ could lead to higher procurement costs for tendered bus services. There is also potential that new technology/retrofit costs could be passed onto WYCA within existing contracted services.
- 3.2 There is likely to be further government grant funding made available to local authorities to support public and private fleets in improving emissions and achieving CAZ compliance.

### **4 Legal Implications**

- 4.1 None identified

### **5 Staffing Implications**

- 5.1 None identified

### **6 External Consultees**

- Leeds City Council
- West Yorkshire Bus Operators

### **7 Recommendations**

- 7.1 To note the publication of the proposed Leeds Clean Air Zone and provide any additional comments to be raised with Leeds City Council though development of a Clean Air Zone proposal.
- 7.2 To endorse WYCA's support for and collaborative working with Leeds City Council during the development and implementation of the proposed Clean Air Zone.
- 7.3 To support WYCA's continued investment in programmes that support air quality improvement and the ongoing work with businesses and transport operators to improve vehicles and fleets for the benefit of all West Yorkshire residents and businesses through improved public health and cleaner air.

### **8 Background Documents**

- 8.1 Further information on the Leeds Clean Air Zone proposal can be found here; <http://www.leeds.gov.uk/Business/Pages/Air-quality.aspx>
- 8.2 The Leeds City Council Executive Board paper for the 13 December 2017 detailing why Leeds is required to act, the options considered and preferred solution can be found here; <http://democracy.leeds.gov.uk/documents/s168257/Air%20Quality%20Cover%20Report%20031217.pdf>